

BUREAU OF OCEAN ENERGY MANAGEMENT (BOEM)
NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FORUM
WEDNESDAY, JULY 26, 2023
10:30 A.M. – 12:30 P.M. ET
VIRTUAL MEETING

This document summarizes the discussion and key themes heard at the July 26, 2023, Environmental Justice Forum (EJF), hosted by the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM). The meeting is part of a larger EJF series. The goals of the EJF series are to:

- Identify priorities, needs, and issues to address through BOEM’s draft New York Bight PEIS specific to environmental justice and underserved communities.
- Improve information-sharing and coordination across agencies, governments, lessees, community-based organizations, and Indigenous Peoples.
- Create greater accountability by providing transparency to communities on whether and how their input has affected the decision-making process.
- Grow long-term relationships with communities that are founded on mutual respect, understanding, and collaboration.
- Reduce barriers to participation, increase access to environmental reviews, and create better-informed decisions.

Contents

1. Action Items
2. Meeting Participants
3. Bulletin Board Announcements
4. Discussion Highlights
 - a. Welcome, Introductions, and Agenda Overview
 - b. Updates from BOEM & Lessees
 1. Status update on draft Programmatic Environmental Impact Statement (PEIS)
 2. Update on BOEM Website
 3. Lessee Updates
 4. Ocean Justice Strategy Update
 5. Input Status Report Updates
 - c. Presentations from Federal Agencies
 - d. Discussion Topic: Co-create objectives for the in-person October EJF
5. Next Steps and Adjourn

Appendix A: Virtual Whiteboard Activity

1. Action Items

- **BOEM** to share more information on the October EIJ's date, time, and location.

2. Meeting Participants

BOEM Staff

- Sindy Chaky; Social Scientist
- Meghan Cornelison; Social Scientist
- Annette Ehrhorn; Project Coordinator
- Holly Fowler; Program Analyst
- Laura Mansfield; Social Scientist
- Dustin Reuther; Social Scientist
- Blossom Robinson; Renewable Energy Engagement
- Amy Shanahan; Archeologist
- Courtney Strain; Oceanographer
- Chloe VanderMolen; Knauss Fellow

Community Based Organizations

- Charles Callaway; WE ACT
- Ana Fisyak; Collective for Community, Culture, and Environment; Equinor
- Spring Gaines; Center for Planning Excellence
- Gwen Gallagher; NY Sea Grant
- Thomas Ikeda; Kean University
- Sara Parkinson; Turn Forward
- Sam Schact; Clean Energy State Alliance
- Lucas Shumaker; WAMPUM Lab University of Waterloo
- Michael Skelly; Environmental Justice Task Force - UU Faith Action NJ
- Lincoln Simmons; Ocean County College
- Annecia Steiniger; NJLCV
- Sunni Vargas; NJLCV
- Camila Vasquez; Ministerio de Energia
- Chris Whitehead; ESI
- Heidi Yeh; Pinelands Preservation Alliance

Tribes

- Dennis Coker; Lenape Indian Tribe of Delaware
- Jason Hansana-Cofield; Shinnecock Nation

State and Local Agencies

- Rehanna Azimi; NJDEP
- Christina Gonzalve; NJDEP
- Meghan Henry MacLeod; NJDEP

- Gwyneth Mathews, NYSDOS
- Laura McLean; NYSDOS
- Katherine Nolan; NJDEP
- Kandyce Perry; NJDEP
- Myla Ramirez; NJDEP
- Cathy Yuhas; NJEDA

Federal Agencies

- Jordan Creed; BSEE
- Nelle D’Aversa; NOAA OCM
- Darlene Finch, NOAA Office for Coastal Management
- David Fish; BSEE
- Jonathan Fraser, BSEE
- Miriam Goldstein; CEQ
- Stefany Grieco; BSEE
- Samuel Herbert; DOE Office of Economic Impact & Diversity
- Samantha Nyer; EPA
- Jared Pritts; USACE
- Tara Shifflett; BSEE
- Angela Silva; NOAA Fisheries
- Lupe Villatoro; DOE Office of Economic Impact & Diversity

Lessees

- Andrea Bonilla; Vineyard Mid-Atlantic
- Retha Fernandez; Community Offshore Wind
- Laura George; Vineyard Mid-Atlantic
- Favio Germain; Attentive Energy
- Oriana Holmes-Price; Attentive Energy
- Katherine Miller; Community Offshore Wind
- Michael Porto; Leading Light Wind
- Lisa Wood; Bluepoint Wind

Kearns and West Facilitation Team

- Caisey Hoffman
- Hanna Khalil
- Briana Moseley
- Leigh Osterhus
- Jenna Tourjé-Maldonado

3. Bulletin Board Announcements

Beacon Wind NOI public scoping process is currently underway through July 31.

- You can find more information [on this page](#) and you can submit public comment through [this link](#).

NOAA invites participants to learn more about an FY25 funding opportunity for ocean and coastal management.

- You can find more information at [this link](#).
- Proposals are due on October 10, 2023.
- There is an informational webinar on August 10, 1:00pm EDT. Register at this [link](#).

The Office of Science and Technology Policy (OSTP) is requesting information to inform its National Strategy for a Sustainable Ocean Economy.

- The National Strategy will describe the vision, goals, and high-level actions for a robust, equitable, secure, sustainable ocean economy enabled by healthy, resilient ocean ecosystems.
- Comments are due 8/28 and can be submitted at [this link](#).

4. Discussion Highlights

Welcome, Introductions, and Agenda Review

The meeting facilitator welcomed participants to the EJF and expressed gratitude for their attendance. This fourth EJF is designed from an ongoing series of iterative conversations on how BOEM can serve the needs of environmental justice and underserved communities through the process of developing offshore wind.

The meeting facilitator reviewed the meeting objectives, agenda, and participant guidelines.

BOEM core staff introduced themselves on video while participants introduced themselves in the chat.

Updates from BOEM & Lessees

Status update on draft Programmatic Environmental Impact Statement (PEIS)

BOEM is currently working on the draft PEIS for the six lease areas in the New York Bight auctioned in 2022. These EJFs are tied directly to the six lease areas covered by this PEIS, while there are additional leases in the broader area.

The purpose of the PEIS is to analyze regional environmental impacts and is focused on a cumulative analysis with programmatic avoidance and mitigation measures.

Currently, the preliminary draft is out for cooperating agency review. BOEM is planning to hold in-person and virtual meetings during the 45-day comment period following the draft's publication in early 2024. As a reminder, project-specific environmental reviews are still required separately from this Programmatic EIS process.

The first EJF was designed from an Environmental Justice Roundtable event in July 2022, and has evolved based on feedback. There will be another EJF in October 2023 before the Draft PEIS is published.

Update on BOEM Website

[BOEM's New York Bight website](#) has been updated so that each lease area has its own page, linked under the "Background" header in the "Project Overview" tab. On each of these pages, you can find lease-specific information such as submitted plans and quarterly progress reports.

Lessee Updates

The facilitator invited lessees to provide any project updates.

A **lessee** shared that Community Offshore Wind went on a tour of the Ironbound community in Newark as a guest of the Ironbound Community Corporation, where they visited their farm and learned about the history of the area. This is part of COW's on-going work to listen to coastal communities who may be impacted by offshore development.

A **lessee** shared that in June, Attentive Energy hosted a community fair in Western Queens to show how their offshore wind project will help retire 1960s fossil fuel infrastructure, including old peaker plants. 200 people attended, including Environmental Justice leaders and representatives. They are currently working on developing a findings report. In New Jersey, Attentive Energy recently hosted a supplier diversity event to educate minority and women-owned businesses on where they can fit into the offshore wind supply chain and development process.

A **lessee** shared that in addition to continued community outreach, Leading Light Wind is conducting methane and geophysical survey operations and gave testimony on Capitol Hill regarding green energy projects on federal lands and how to better work together with communities.

Ocean Justice Strategy Update

BOEM staff provided an overview of the Ocean Justice Strategy.

The federal government is working on the Ocean Justice Strategy to implement the Ocean Climate Action Plan. The development of the strategy is led by the Ocean Policy Committee, co-chaired by the White House Office of Science and Technology Policy, and the White House Council of Environmental Quality. The strategy will describe the vision, goals, and high-level objectives for coordinating ocean justice goals in the federal government and the goal is to promote equitable and just practices to advance safety, health, and prosperity for communities residing near the ocean, coasts, great lakes, and beyond. The strategy will discuss:

- What is ocean justice?
- What are the barriers, challenges, opportunities, and success stories related to ocean justice?
- What are some knowledge gaps?
- How can we incorporate existing EJ tools and practices?
- What kind of partnerships and collaborative opportunities are there within the federal government?

The public comment period closed on July 24, but BOEM is continuing to participate in the writing of the strategy. **BOEM staff** invited anybody who has further feedback or who would like to discuss the strategy further to contact Laura Mansfield at laura.mansfield@Boem.gov to set up a follow-up discussion.

Input Status Report Updates

BOEM staff provided an overview of the Input Status Report (ISR), which is developed after each forum to document what input was heard at each forum and how BOEM is addressing it. The ISR was sent out in advance of the Forum and can be found on the BOEM website.

BOEM staff highlighted three key issues to ground today's conversation:

1. Issue Code A.19:
 - a. Participants have asked about information for monitoring and enforcement during construction and operations, how mitigation measures are enforced, and what monitoring exists during construction.
 - b. This will be elaborated on by BSEE later in the discussion.
2. Issue Codes A.07 and A.10
 - a. There have been various conversations around equity considerations including energy distribution, engagement process equity benefits, job creation, and other areas.
 - b. Partners from DOE Office of Economic Impact and Diversity will share about their agency's work in this space.
3. Issue Codes A.05, A.06 and A.12
 - a. We have also heard from participants on the need to discuss impacts on commercial, recreational, and subsistence fishing by OSW.
 - b. Colleagues from NOAA will share their work on environmental justice and fisheries space.

Presentations from Federal Agencies

BOEM: Federal Agency Table

BOEM staff provided an overview of the ***Organizational Roles on the Offshore Wind and Related Environmental Justice Responsibilities Table***, which can be found on the [BOEM website](#) under the "Additional Information" tab.

In previous discussions, BOEM heard from forum participants that it would be helpful to have a better understanding of the various federal agencies involved in offshore wind. In response, BOEM reached out to several agencies to hear, in their words, their role and responsibilities as it pertains to offshore wind and environmental justice. These responses were consolidated into the table, which is organized by agencies that have a regulatory or permitting role in offshore wind, and agencies that have expertise that overlaps with direct regulatory responsibility more broadly. The table is not comprehensive of all agencies, and BOEM will continue to update it as additional agencies provide information to include.

Department of Energy (DOE): Office of Economic Impact and Diversity

Lupe Villatoro, Social Scientist for Energy Justice and **Sam Herbert**, Senior EEJ Policy Advisor provided a presentation of the DOE's Office of Economic Impact and Diversity's work. The presentation covered:

- The office's 5 key focus areas
- DOE's Justice40 Policy Priorities
- Overview of what constitutes a Community Benefits Plan
- List of additional resources

For more detailed information, please see the PowerPoint presentation, available on [BOEM's website](#) under the "Meeting Information" tab.

Bureau of Safety and Environmental Enforcement (BSEE)

David Fish and **Jonathan Fraser** led a presentation on BSEE's work related to offshore wind development. The presentation covered:

- BSEE's obligations as per the Continental Shelf Lands Act
- How BSEE and BOEM's responsibilities overlap or differ through the lifespan of a project
- BSEE's role ensuring environmental compliance
- BSEE's oversight responsibilities related to on-site assessments, construction and operations plans, design, fabrication and installation, operations, and decommissioning
- Enforcement options

For more detailed information, please see the PowerPoint presentation, available on [BOEM's website](#) under the "Meeting Information" tab.

National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA)

Angela Silva, National Marine Fisheries Service, and **Nelle D'Aversa**, Office of Coastal Management, led a presentation on NOAA's role in offshore wind development. The presentation covered:

- How NOAA works with BOEM on offshore wind development activities
- How NOAA informs offshore wind through data
- The Social Indicators for Coastal Communities Toolbox
- Research and monitoring models and frameworks
- NOAA's engagement with partners and stakeholders

For more detailed information, please see the PowerPoint presentation, available on [BOEM's website](#) under the "Meeting Information" tab.

Discussion Topic: Co-Creation of the October EIJ

BOEM shared that it is in the early stages of planning an in-person October EIJ. In previous meetings, participants shared a desire for an in-person gathering, and BOEM is looking to hear feedback from participants on how we can shape the October EIJ to be the most useful.

The meeting facilitator led participants in a discussion covering three main questions:

- What does a successful in-person EIJ look like to you?
- What topics are you most interested in discussing at the October EIJ?
- How do we want to structure the October EIJ, given we will be in-person?

The **meeting facilitator** provided a link to an online whiteboarding tool called Jamboard, in which participants could share their responses anonymously by writing on digital sticky notes. To see screenshots of the completed boards, see Appendix A.

Within each question, the meeting facilitator encouraged participants to elaborate orally, and also highlighted key themes across responses.

What does a successful in-person EJF look like to you?

Key themes across responses included:

- Wide-spread representation of and participation of EJ communities, including community-led presentations
- Tribal engagement
- Structured opportunities for networking
- Actionable conversations
- Space for sharing resources, including funding and grant opportunities

Participants also elaborated orally:

- A **lessee** shared that in order to get a critical mass of participants, we need to clearly identify the value proposition of the forum so that folks know why it is worth their time to attend.
 - This may include educational information or new tools to better engage with industry. He also suggested that BOEM compensate attendees for their expertise.
- A **community organization member** shared that tribes need to be engaged in all aspects of offshore wind development including: planning analysis, site assessment, leasing, permitting, construction, operations, and decommissioning.
 - It is critical that all the lessees are in contact with all the tribal nations involved.
 - Many tribal nations feel overlooked and feel that they are thought of as an afterthought, and would like to be brought to the table on every aspect of OSW development.
 - There is ancestral trauma associated with continued colonization.
 - His nation is in favor of offshore wind but wants to make sure it is done right.
- A **lessee** emphasized the importance of removing barriers to participation by providing childcare, transportation, and food.

What priority topics would you like to see covered in an in-person EJF?

Key themes included:

- Workforce development within EJ communities
- Inclusion of Tribal nations
- Strategizing on better engagement, including minimizing stakeholder fatigue
- Collaboration between community organizations and developers
- Identifying key community-specific concerns and actionable steps to address them
- Addressing cumulative impacts

How should we structure an in-person EJF?

Key themes included:

- Ensuring accessibility by providing food, transportation, translation, childcare and hosting the event in the evenings
- Providing space to listen directly to EJ groups and community members
- Providing time for meaningful networking and casual conversations with BOEM and other participants

BOEM staff posed the question: do participants feel ready to involve more community members, beyond organization representatives within an EJF? BOEM staff also proposed an approach in which there is one session focused on community organizations, and another session targeting local community members. Participants were encouraged to share their feedback on this and other questions both orally and through a feedback form.

Lessees shared strategies they have used in past community events to remove barriers to participation including providing childcare, as well as partnering with food trucks to provide food and food to take home.

October EJF Input Form

The meeting facilitator screen-shared and ran through the questions listed in [this input form](#). The input form aims to gather feedback on questions related to meeting time, location, and structure. All participants are encouraged to fill out the form and share it with their networks.

5. Next Steps

The next EJF will be held in October 2023, most likely in-person. BOEM will follow up in the coming weeks to share the meeting location and time.

Participants were invited to [share their feedback](#) on the event format, pre- and post- EJF activities, meeting goals, future agenda topics, and any other suggestions through a feedback form.

The contact information for the EJF was shared:

- For further input and discussion, email environmental.justice@boem.gov
- New York and New Jersey offshore wind environmental justice engagement team:
 - Laura Mansfield, Laura.Mansfield@boem.gov
 - Meghan Cornelison, Meghan.Cornelison@boem.gov
 - Chloe VanderMolen, Chloe.Vandermolen@boem.gov
 - Holly Fowler, Holly.Fowler@boem.gov

The facilitator closed by thanking participants for their participation and inviting participants to an optional social conversation directly following the forum.

The meeting adjourned at 12:30 pm ET.

Appendix A: Screenshots of Jamboard

Please see below for a screenshot of the completed Jamboard slides that participants filled out:



What priority topics would you like to see covered in an in-person EJF?

Preparing EJ communities to be competitive for green jobs

NIMBY-ism in privileged communities

Engaging inland vs. coastal communities

Identify individual community concerns vs overall EJ concerns

Ensure Nations are included in all aspects.

Strategize on outreach to harness our collective efforts and reach deeper into communities. Brainstorm ways to address stakeholder fatigue

Presentation from OSW developers about their strategies (even early efforts) for hiring local, community benefits, community consultation

space for job and grant opportunities

All aspects of the offshore wind process

Might be helpful - Provide info/clarity on engagement through Section 106 vs other types of engagement

Chat about whether EJ concerns are being addressed adequately and timely, and whether there's a need to better track or accelerate specific concerns.

How Developers and EJ groups can work together on political advocacy

topics - addressing cumulative impacts and intergenerational impacts and compensations

ways we can work together to make sure the OSW projects are successful - for communities and for those trying to get the projects built

addressing cumulative impacts and intergenerational impacts and compensations

How should we structure an in-person EJF?

Identify hotels for out of towners with discounted rates

language access

Suggested location: northern NJ, NYC metro area

interactive environment, not just presentations

charrette style - with findings/report from it that can feed into projects

providing childcare to allow for community member participation

Structure - listening sessions for EJ groups to talk and developers in "listen only mode" Structure - "office hours" for more personalized convos

ADA accessible + away from police stations if possible + near mass transit + host in the evening so those who work can also participate + host somewhere w childcare nearby

A process that allows for everyone to have the opportunity to participate and that everyone's comments are weighted equally, not just the loudest in the room.

Clear goals and desired outcomes for modules

good food and coffee are a requirement for in-person meetings in the post-pandemic world!

What about a hybrid event? Perhaps we should have a virtual option for those who really can't attend?

topics - addressing cumulative impacts and intergenerational impacts and compensations

transportation provided

Accessible with multi-modal transportation or walkable

have it in a public transportation accessible area

listening sessions for EJ groups to talk and developers in "listen only mode"

"office hours" for more personalized convos

providing food that can be taken home after

Opportunities throughout the day to mingle for casual conversation